



INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION OF LIBRARY ASSOCIATIONS
AND INSTITUTIONS
WORLD LIBRARY AND INFORMATION CONGRESS

82nd IFLA GENERAL CONFERENCE AND ASSEMBLY
Columbus, Ohio, United States of America
13-19 AUGUST 2016

CATALOGUING SECTION
ISBD Review Group
<http://www.ifla.org/en/isbd-rg>

DRAFT MINUTES

Meetings:

ISBD Review Group

Monday 15 August 2016 16:00-17:00 (Room C226)

Thursday 18 August 2016 14:30-16:00 (Room C226)

Attendees, members and liaisons: Renate Behrens (liaison with the RDA Steering Committee), María Violeta Bertolini (member, ISBD Linked Data Study Group co-chair), Vincent Boulet (member - 1st meeting), Gordon Dunsire (member, RDA Steering Committee chair), Elena Escolano Rodríguez (corresponding member - attending remotely), Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (chair, ISBD Linked Data SG member and IAML liaison), Irena Kavčič (member), Françoise Leresche (member, ISBD Linked Data Study Group member, FRBR RG liaison) Dorothy McGarry (member), Susan Morris (member), Clément Oury (member, ISSN IC liaison), Ricardo Santos Muñoz (member)

Apologies: Ben Gu (corresponding member), Takahiro Watanabe (corresponding member) Mirna Willer

Attendees, representatives of other bodies and groups: Abraham Azubuike (LIDATEC chair - 2nd meeting), Agnese Galeffi (Cataloguing Section information officer), Chris Oliver (FRBR Review Group chair), Pat Riva (FRBR Review Group Consolidation Editorial Group member), Mélanie Roche (ISBD Linked Data Study Group co-chair), Miriam Säfström (Cataloguing Section chair - 2nd meeting), Jay Weitz (Permanent Unimarc Committee vice-chair), Joanne Yeomans (Professional Committee secretary, liaison with Committee on Standards)

Observers, 1st meeting: Iman Dagher (University of California), John Hostage (Harvard University), Lynne Howarth (University of Toronto), Patrick Le Boeuf (Cataloguing Section Standing Committee), Sandy Roe (Cataloguing and Classification Quarterly), Regina Romano Reynolds (Library of Congress), Richard Sapon-White (Oregon State University), Marja-Liisa Seppala (National Library of Finland), Cynthia Whitacre (OCLC), Jenny Wright (BDS)

Observers, 2nd meeting: Barbora Drobiková (Cataloguing Section Standing Committee), Patrick Le Boeuf (Cataloguing Section Standing Committee), Alejandra Muñoz Gómez Drobiková (Cataloguing Section Standing Committee), René-Vincent du Grandlaunay (Institut dominicain d'études orientales, Egypt), Kelley McGrath (VOF Oregon), Angela Omiroz (Biblioteca del Congreso, Chile) Sandy Roe (Cataloguing and Classification Quarterly), Marijana Tomič (University of Zadar, Croatia), Jenny Wright (BDS)

Note that these minutes do not necessarily reflect the chronological order in which each topic was discussed.

1. Welcome and introductions

M. Gentili-Tedeschi welcomed the members, representatives of other bodies and groups, observers, and Renate Behrens, new liaison with . He thanked Agnese Galeffi, Cataloguing Section's information officer for maintaining the ISBD RG's website, and Gordon Dunsire for maintaining the namespace.

2. Agenda

The agenda was adopted with the following change:

Item 9 - Elections is added, Item 10.1 - Ask the Professional Committee to include in the programme the meetings of the Review Group is added to renumbered Item 10 - Any other business.

3. Approval of the Minutes of the ISBD RG Meeting, Cape Town, 2015,
http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/meeting_2015.pdf

Minutes were approved with no changes.

4. Matters arising from the Minutes of the Cape Town meeting and the Action List,
http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/action_list_2011-2015.pdf (updated version of 1 October 2015). Specific topics to be discussed:

- 4.1 Guidelines for use of ISBD as Linked Data (Action 11/14: finalize the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data*, to send for comments and approval, and publish, M. V. Bertolini)

The *Guidelines* were finalised during the ISBD Linked Data Study Group face-to-face meeting in Paris, 30-31 May, funded by the Professional Committee as part of the project *Development of the International Standard Bibliographic Description*, needing only formal revision, and approved by the ISBD Review Group.

Action 1/16: Send final draft of *Guidelines for the use of ISBD as linked data* to the Cataloguing Section and to the Committee on Standards for final approval. Publish on the ISBD LD SG website: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

- 4.2 ISBD alignment with FRBR (Action 13/14: prepare Alignment of the ISBD with FRBR, M. V. Bertolini)

The Alignment was discussed during the ISBD Linked Data Study Group face-to-face meeting in Paris, 30-31 May, and the only pending issues were resolved during the meeting of the ISBD LD SG in Columbus. The draft was approved by the ISBD Review group, needing only the revision of two sentences in the introduction.

Action 2/16: Finalise draft of *Alignment of ISBD element set with FRBR element set* revising the introduction: M. V. Bertolini, M. Roche, asap

Action 3/16: Send final draft of *Alignment of ISBD element set with FRBR element set* to the Cataloguing Section and to the Committee on Standards for final approval: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

- 4.3 Discussion paper #2 (ISBD Area 2 for the mid-term meeting of the Cataloguing section, April 2016) (Action 6/14, discuss the two chosen scenarios discussed at the ISBD Strategy Meeting 2014, and report to the SC, M. Gentili-Tedeschi)

Upon request of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, M. Gentili-Tedeschi prepared for the mid-term meeting of the SC, held in Paris on 29 April 2016, a second discussion paper, based on the analysis of Area 2 of the ISBD, and an annex containing documentation and examples..

The discussion paper raised similar issues as the first one, presented to the CATS SC at WLIC in August 2015, and proposed similar problems, to be discussed for the future revision of the ISBD, in its correlation with the other IFLA standards, and in particular with the forthcoming FRBR consolidated model, here referred to as FRBR-LRM.¹

- 4.4 Report to LIDATEC the requirements for ensuring IFLA registry of bibliographic standards alignments and mappings in GitHub (Action 1/15, M. Willer)

¹ The following whole-day meeting of the FRBR Review Group decided that the name of the model shall be IFLA Library Reference Model (IFLA LRM, or simply LRM).

The report was presented on 26 August 2015, but no action has been taken by IFLA until now. In his report, the acting chair of LIDATEC, Abraham Azubuike, however confirms that within two year the infrastructure will be on place.

Action 4/16: Follow LIDATEC discussion on developments of infrastructure for hosting IFLA bibliographic standards alignments and maps and report to ISBD RG: M Willer, WLIC, August 2017

- 4.5 Mapping ISBD Area 0 compound terms to ROF vocabularies (Action 2/15, Check the existing mapping of compound terms from ISBD Area 0 Content form and Content qualification with ROF base categories, send to ISBD RG, CS SC and LIDATEC for comments and approval, publish: G. Dunsire)

Gordon Dunsire apologised for not completing the task, and assured he would accomplish it as soon as possible.

Action 5/16: Check the existing mapping of compound terms from ISBD Area 0 Content form and Content qualification with ROF base categories, send to ISBD RG, CS SC and LIDATEC for comments and approval, publish: G. Dunsire, asap

- 4.6 Guidelines for translations of the IFLA ISBD namespace in RDF (Action 3/15: submit *Guidelines for translations of the IFLA ISBD namespace in RDF, ver. 1.0* to the Committee on Standards for approval and publication on the CoS website, M. Gentili-Tedeschi)

Version 1.0 dated April 2015 of the *Guidelines*,² approved by the ISBD RG and the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, was sent to the chair of the Committee on Standard on 4 August 2015; having received no reply, after discussing the issue at the Committee on Standards meeting at WLIC Columbus on 17 August 2016, the file was resent the same day. No further action needed.

- 4.7 ISBD/RDA alignment (Action 5/15, Update ISBD/RDA alignment if necessary and publish the mapping in RDF: G. Dunsire)

Gordon Dunsire reported that no update was necessary. Action will continue for each update of RDA, with special attention for the update needed to align RDA with the FRBR-LRM.

Action 6/16, Update ISBD/RDA alignment if necessary and publish the mapping in RDF: G. Dunsire

5. Chair's report

5.1 Cataloguing Section's Strategic Plan for ISBD review

The chair of the ISBD RG presented at the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee meeting a paper highlighting the urgency of a decision on the future scenario for the ISBD. The approval of the FRBR-LRM is due in a short time, and there is no reason why the ISBD should be put on hold for another year, considering among others the interest in the standard demonstrated by the survey³ and the relevance of its use as a syntax format in RDA. IFLA standard should be revised every five years, and the work for the revision has yet to start, despite all the preparatory work done, preparing alignments and maps that have shown elements that need to be investigated or developed, and collecting observations and notes for the future work. The paper concluded proposing to adopt what had been suggested at the midterm meeting, i.e. having descriptive principles followed by a set of suggested rules to that principle.

The chair remembered that during the past three years of discussion, the so-called scenario C (to plan for a shorter and more principal ISBD) had never been clearly defined by those that have proposed it, while the Review Group has worked and produced detailed discussion papers, all based on scenario A2 (to continue the content of ISBD on the current level but change to reflect FRBR), the only one that the Review Group considers representing the "global voice and interest of countries" that IFLA stands for. It

² http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/OtherDocumentation/guidelines-ifla_isbd-namespace-translation-_v.1.0_april2015.pdf

³ See ISBD survey report, http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/isbd-survey-2015-report_final.pdf.

must be underlined that both the ISSN International Committee and the RDA Steering Committee have manifested their support and interest for the revision as a content-oriented standard.

M. Gentili-Tedeschi concluded saying that if no decision was taken by the Standing Committee, or should scenario C prevail, he would resign from his position of chair and member of the ISBD Review group.

A long, intense, sometimes animated discussion followed in the second meeting of the Standing Committee, which was concluded that the next year the ISBD Review Group shall work on facing the issues of making the ISBD compliant with the FRBR-LRM. The work will start as soon as the new model is available in its final form.

5.2 ISBD activity report: project and financial reports

An application for funding the project *Development of the International Standard Bibliographic Description* was made to the Professional Committee, to enable the Review Group organise a two-day face-to-face meeting of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group in Spring 2016 in order to finalise the Guidelines, a second meeting in order to start the harmonisation of the ISBD with the FRBR-LRM, and to enable a representative of the Review Group attend the meeting of the RSC.

Only the first meeting was funded, all 1000 euros were spent for the meeting held in Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, 30-31 May 2016, attended in person by six members, with three connected remotely via Skype. The funds covered in part travel and accommodation expenses for G. Dunsire and M. Willer. The chair of the RG wishes to thank the BnF for kindly offering the space for the meeting. The outcome of the meeting was to complete the work on the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* and the *ISBD to FRBR namespaces alignment*, which were approved during the August 2016 meetings of the ISBD Review Group, see points 4.1 and 4.2 of these minutes.

5.3 CS – ISBD Review Group Activities Report, August 2015 – August 2016

The written report was sent to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee and circulated among its members before the meeting at WLIC 2016, receiving no comments.

5.4 ISBD and the midterm meeting of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee (Paris, 29 April 2016)

Upon request of the Standing Committee, the chair presented the discussion paper described in par. 4.3.

5.5 Publications and presentations

Polish, Serbian and Slovenian are reported in preparation, which will bring the number of languages in which the ISBD is available to 13.

6. Development of the standard

Following the decision taken at the second meeting of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, the second section of the meeting was mostly focused on the future actions.

The FRBR-LRM is less granular than the preceding model, thus, FRBRising the ISBD, IFLA will show how the model may be extended in an application.

6.1 Actions to be planned according to the strategy chosen by the Standing committee of the Cataloguing Section

The group discussed the actions for the next year, focusing on the alignment with FRBR-LRM, with a future aim to revise the ISBD according to the FRBR-LRM, including instructions on non-published materials as per the decision taken at the Puerto Rico meeting in 2011, facing the issues raised during the analysis issued to produce the discussion papers and the work done on alignments and mappings, and including the indications that have been collected after the publication of the ISBD consolidated edition of 2011.

The group decided that the work should start with the ISBD Linked Data Study Group drafting an alignment of the ISBD element set with the FRBR-LRM element set. That work will have to wait the final

version of the FRBR-LRM, even if the transition mappings from the old to the new model are not yet published. Pat Riva, chair of the FRBR Consolidation Editorial Committee observed in fact that these will be the very last task, as they are a complex work, needing to have the final draft approved. They will thus be useful to verify the proposed alignments. According to Violeta Bertolini, the new alignment to FRBR-LRM does not appear to be a complex issue, thus producing a new document should take approximately 20 days.

Action 7/16: Draft *Alignment of ISBD element set to FRBR-LRM element set*, present to the ISBD RG for further analysis: ISBD Linked Data Study Group, 20 days after the FRBR-LRM is made available

The second step will be to set up a working group evaluating the alignment and starting to work on the attributes needed as extensions and refinements of the model, in order to fully express the ISBD elements. There is yet no clear consensus on the number of members of that group, that might vary from three to six or seven. Interested communities, such as RDA and ISSN will be welcome to join in the analysis work, as the maximum cooperation and openness is desirable and an alignment with FRBR-LRM is a common issue, so it is useless to duplicate work. A face-to-face meeting will be unavoidable in order to finalise the work, as it is very complex, and may be foreseen for early Spring 2017.

Action 8/16: Prepare project for alignment activities and submit to the Cataloguing section for the Committee on standards and the Professional Committee: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, mid-October 2016

Action 9/16: Set up a working group for the analysis of the alignment and impact of FRBR-LRM to ISBD: ISBD Review Group, 2 weeks after the conclusion of action 7/16

Action 10/16: Organise face-to-face meeting of the working group: ISBD Analysis WG, Early 2017

6.2 Issues on mapping and alignment with the FRBR-LRM

Françoise Leresche observed that the ISBD could become a content code for FRBR-LRM, at least in part, and that the alignment will highlight attributes and relationships that may become extensions of the model.

Gordon Dunsire remembered that a strategic analysis on how ISBD should fit FRBR-LRM should be carried on, and that a new edition of ISBD needs not to be produced only because there is a new model, but what is to be the new positioning of ISBD; RDA will have to do a similar work.

7. Status of projects, activities and issues arising during IFLA meetings

7.1 Cataloguing Section's Standing Committee (M. Säfström)

M. Säfström resumed the last two year discussion, following the decision of the Professional Committee to clarify the roadmap in the evolution of IFLA standards, firstly aimed at conferring funds. The discussion then went to the Standing Committee, exploring the possible scenarios, but the Cataloguing Section did not receive the necessary feedback for a decision.

Patrice Landry has drafted a report for the Committee on Standards, which was not diffused, on the activities of working groups, in order to guarantee long-term work, in particular for the Permanent UNIMARC Committee, and ISBD and FRBR Review Groups, with a list of recommendations, including the fact that working groups have to report directly to the Committee on Standards and not to the Cataloguing Section, which remains responsible for the content of the standards.

The report was accepted, and the Professional Committee has decided to implement the recommendations during the next year. The revision of the ISBD should start after the establishment of this activity of Committee on Standards and Professional Committee, but first there is to do the alignment between ISBD and the FRBR-LRM.

7.2 ISBD Linked Data Study Group (M. V. Bertolini)

The activity of the Study Group is described in paragraphs 4.1, 4.2, 4.6, 5.2 of these minutes.

7.3 FRBR Review Group (Ch. Oliver)

There was no formal report, but during the sessions the issue of the new model was thoroughly discussed. The issues raised at the world-wide review laid to a new version of the model, that is likely to be finalised during the whole-day meeting of the FRBR Review Group following the WLIC, on Friday 18 August; a short editorial work, including the setting of transition maps, will be then carried on, and the final draft will be published as soon as possible, while the approval from the Cataloguing section and the Committee on Standards and the adoption of the model by the Professional Committee will need more time. Timing will be clear only after the meeting.

Considering the impact of the FRBR-LRM on ISBD, the ISBD has decided to invite a representative of the FRBR Review Group in the future work, thus the following action was planned:

Action 11/16: Contact FRBR Review Group to establish a liaison in order to co-ordinate the analysis work: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

7.4 Linked Data Technical Sub-Committee (LIDATEC, A. Azubuike)

Abraham Azubuike, acting chair of LIDATEC, reported that, due to health reasons of the chair, the committee was little active in the past year; they plan to draft a technical manual for the Committee of Standards and are confident that within two years an IFLA infrastructure to publish data, alignments and maps will be operational.

7.5 Permanent UNIMARC Committee (I. Cordeiro)

No report was submitted.

7.6 Committee on Standards (J. Richards)

No further report was submitted.

7.7 RDA Steering Committee (RSC) (G. Dunsire)

In his position of chair of the RDA Steering Committee, G. Dunsire repeatedly expressed the interest in collaborating to the development of the FRBRised ISBD as a full content standard, and in the maintenance of its harmonisation with RDA. He then invited the members of the ISBD Review Groups to attend as observer the annual meeting of the RSC, which will take place in Frankfurt A/M on 7-11 November 2016. An official invitation will follow in a short time.

Agreeing to these proposals, the following action was planned:

Action 12/16: Contact RDA Steering Committee to establish a liaison in order to co-ordinate the analysis work: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

8. Relations with other international organizations and committees: updates from other projects and groups

8.1 ISSN Network

Clément Oury, as liaison to the ISSN Network, remembered that the network consists of 89 members in 89 countries, some of which use ISBD, others RDA, with description conflicts. The ISSN Board decided that the ISSN manual is based on the ISBD, thus ISSN is interested in any development of the ISBD, and willing to contribute to its harmonisation with other cataloguing practices.

In consideration to these observation, the following action was planned:

Action 13/16: Contact ISSN International Committee to establish a liaison in order to co-ordinate the analysis work: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

9. Elections

In 2017 some members of the ISBD Review Group will terminate their 1st or 2nd term; the present roster is as follows:

- María Violeta Bertolini 1st term ends 2017

- Vincent Boulet 1st term ends 2019
- Gordon Dunsire 1st term ends 2019
- Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi 2nd term ends 2019
- Irena Kavcic 2nd term ends 2017
- Françoise Leresche 2nd term ends 2017
- Dorothy McGarry 1st term ends 2019
- Susan R. Morris 1st term ends 2019
- Clément Oury 1st term ends 2019
- Ricardo Santos 1st term ends 2017
- Mirna Willer 2nd term ends 2019

Two new members, Irena Kavcic and Françoise Leresche, will end their mandate, thus at least two places are vacant. In order to maintain the international background of the ISBD there is the maximum interest in involving members coming from countries which do not use the Latin alphabet.

The chair observed that the Cataloguing Section has one member of the Standing Committee coming from Egypt, that might be interested or help in finding Arab speaking candidates, Clément Oury remembered that ISSN Network has members in India, Korea and Japan.

Action 14/16: Find possible candidates for nomination for 2017-2021: ISBD Review Group, July 2017

10. Any other business

10.1 Ask the PC to include in the programme the meetings of the Working Group

The Review Group agreed to ask to the Professional Committee that the meetings of the ISBD Review Group and the ISBD Linked Data Study Group be included in the official WLIC programme. The same issue was raised also by the FRBR Review Group, the request was thus submitted to the secretary, J. Yeomans, who replied that the decision not to publish the meetings of RGs had been made some time ago upon request of the chairs, but that she will submit the new request to the Professional Committee.

10.2 Analysis of scenario C

Françoise Leresche, Mélanie Roche, Mathilde Koskas and Vincent Boulet, all working at the Bibliothèque nationale de France, volunteered to analyse scenario C, to develop a more principal ISBD based on FRBR-LRM, so to better understand its implications. Despite not being requested by the Cataloguing Section nor by the ISBD Review Group, the proposal was accepted.

A report on the result of the analysis will be sent to the ISBD Review Group for evaluations, and final considerations referred to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee.

Action 15/16: Try to figure out ISBD “simplified and more principal” text of ISBD and send to ISBD WG for considerations: F. Leresche, M. Roche, V. Boulet, M. Koskas, February 2017

Action 16/16: Evaluate results of action 15/16, : ISBD Review Group May 2017

Actions 17/16: Send considerations from action 13/16 to Cataloguing section SC: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, June 2017

10.3 Ask the PC set up a mailing list for the Review Group and the Linked Data Study Group

In order to overcome some issues in exchanging emails, the chair asked to J. Yeomans if it may be possible to set up a mailing list for the members of the Review Group and the Linked Data Study Group. She immediately replied with all necessary instructions. The chair will ask members if they agree.

Actions 18/16: Ask members of Review Group and Linked Data Study Group if they agree to set up a mailing list, if affirmative start procedure: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, asap

Respectfully submitted by

Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi, ISBD Review Group, Chair

Milano, 6 September 2016

Attachments:

1. ISBD RG Action List, September 2016
2. Activity report 2015-2016
3. ISBD Revision discussion paper on area 2 for the midterm meeting of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee
4. Annex to the discussion paper on ISBD area 2
5. Paper of the chair for the meeting of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee at WLIC 2016

Notes

Pending action?

Action 12/14: prepare the *Alignment of the UNIMARC/B element set with ISBD element set* for comments to ISBD LD SG, ISBD RG and PUC and adoption, as conditions are met. Publish it on ISBD RG and PUC websites

No action reported on this issue. The meeting decided to ask M. Willer and F. Leresche to finalize the alignment for discussion, August 2016. Distribute for comments also to LIDATEC.

Elections: terms

- María Violeta Bertolini 1st term ends 2017
- Vincent Boulet 1st term ends 2019
- Gordon Dunsire 1st term ends 2019
- Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi 2nd term ends 2019
- Irena Kavcic 2nd term ends 2017
- Françoise Leresche 2nd term ends 2017
- Dorothy McGarry 1st term ends 2019
- Susan R. Morris 1st term ends 2019
- Clément Oury 1st term ends 2019
- Ricardo Santos 1st term ends 2017
- Mirna Willer 2nd term ends 2019

Corresponding members

Elena Escolano Rodríguez
Ben Gu

Liaisons

Renate Behrens RSC liaison
Anders Cato liaison for Katalogiseringsregler og bibliografisk standard for danske biblioteker
Patrizia Martini liaison for Commissione RICA
Regina Varnienė-Janssen liaison for Kompiuterinių bibliografinių ir autorizuotų įrašų sudarymo metodika
Clément Oury ISSN International Center liaison
Takahiro Watanabe liaison from Committee on Cataloging of the Japan Library Association
Mirna Willer liaison to LIDATEC (Linked Data Technical Sub-Committee), Committee on Standards sub-group

ISBD Linked Data Study Group

María Violeta Bertolini, co-chair
Mélanie Roche, co-chair
Vincent Boulet
Gordon Dunsire
Elena Escolano Rodríguez

Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi
Françoise Leresche
Dorothy McGarry
Ricardo Santos Muñoz
Mirna Willer