



**IFLA Cataloguing Section  
FRBR Review Group  
Working Group on Aggregates**

**Meeting Report  
77th IFLA World Library and Information Congress  
San Juan, Puerto Rico  
15 and 16 August 2011  
and  
8 September 2011 (by WebEx)**

**Meeting I  
15 August 2011  
8:00 am-10:00 am**

**Members present:** Ed O'Neill (Chair), Anders Cato, Barbara Tillett, Eeva Murtomaa, Maja Žumer, Patricia Thurston (scribe)

Several members of the FRBR Review Group were present as observers, including Pat Riva, Chair.

Ed O'Neill reviewed committee activities in Gothenburg and since, and the task for this meeting. Two approaches were recognized and discussed. Over the past year the WG has examined nearly 20 examples identified as different types of aggregates or possible aggregates or not aggregates. The WG has explored several approaches to the examples, comparing and commenting on the different approaches. Based on these discussions the WG produced two reports with significant differences: a July 30 report; and a July 29 report.

The WG will end with this conference, and the group needs to submit a report to the FRBR Review Group.

The WG discussed the question: Does the WG accept one report to give to the RG? What's best way to handle this situation?

Pat Riva talked about the current work of the FRBR RG and put the accomplishments of the WG in the context of the RG's work. The RG will receive whatever report the WG sends. The RG can then choose to simply review or decide to adopt the content of the report. The FRSAD and FRAD models have been completed. The RG is currently consolidating the FRBR, FRSAD and FRAD models. The Aggregates WG report might add information to the consolidation efforts. The WG's examples help illustrate a variety of aggregates. The FRBR website has a section where unpublished studies and documents are posted. Examples could go there.

Pat Riva reminded everyone present that the WG's time had already been extended twice and would not be extended again.

Ed O'Neill recommended accepting one report, with the proposal that the WG could make some changes and then submit it to the RG for consideration during the consolidation. The WG could take the second report and talk about any changes within the time constraints of the current meeting.

Barbara Tillett called for a motion to vote. A thoughtful discussion about the two drafts ensued.

The group recognized the incompatible views between the two reports. The WG's original charge from the RG was reviewed and the scope of each report was discussed.

The WG voted on the two reports, resulting in a tie vote.

Pat Riva and other members present from the RG then suggested there might be a way of sending both forward. Pat Riva suggested sending forward the July 30 report that adhered to the original charge of the WG. That report contained an Appendix A, which less-than-successfully attempted to explain the alternative view represented in the July 29 report. The WG group decided to delete the Appendix A from the July 30 report, in favor of creating a new Appendix A based on the July 29 report. The views included in the new appendix from the July 29 report would include only those described in WG's original charge.

The July 30 report contains 4 examples, which will be retained. Pat Riva will consult with the RG about posting the additional examples on the FRBR web site. The examples would be a separate discussion at the second meeting.

The WG voted on the proposal to send the July 30 report forward, as the report that was within the original charge of the WG, with an "Appendix A" containing views from the July 29 report. This proposal passed unanimously.

The WG spent the remainder of the meeting time editing the body of the July 30 report and discussing what would be included in "Appendix A".

It was suggested that in early September the text of "Appendix A" would be submitted to the WG members and Pat Riva. The WG and Pat Riva will participate in an online meeting to complete the final editorial work for "Appendix A".

**IFLA Working Group on Aggregates  
Meeting II  
16 August 2011  
15:00-16:00**

**Members present:** Ed O'Neill (Chair), Anders Cato, Barbara Tillett, Eeva Murtomaa, Maja Zumer, Patricia Thurston (scribe).

**Observer:** Pat Riva, Chair, FRBR Review Group.

Barbara Tillett distributed the draft of a revised Appendix A to all members and an electronic copy was given to the chair. The Chair had sent an updated version of the base report and copies were distributed for further discussion.

The WG worked on additional editorial changes to the revised July 30 text and the four accompanying examples. The Chair will send an updated version of the full report to the members in the next couple of weeks.

Discussion about examples for the FRBR Web Site: The decision at the meeting on the 15th was that the WG would not go to any lengths to document additional modeling examples. Only one additional example was fully modeled. The WG decided it did not have enough justification for the effort it would take to put them on the web site. No examples will be posted.

Pat Riva agreed. If the RG decides it needs more examples, they could ask WG members.

The WG and Pat Riva will meet one last time, virtually via a WebEx meeting, to discuss Appendix A and revisions to the final report, on Thursday, 8 September, 2:00-4:00pm Eastern US time.

**IFLA Working Group on Aggregates  
WebEx Conference Call  
Thursday, 8 September 2011  
14:00-15:30**

**Members present:** Ed O'Neill (Chair), Anders Cato, Barbara Tillett, Eeva Murtomaa, Maja Zumer, Patricia Thurston (scribe).

**Observer:** Pat Riva, Chair, FRBR Review Group.

Prior to the meeting WG members and the observer received electronic copies of the latest draft of the report (7 Sept), including both the Appendix A (Examples) and Appendix B (Alternative Approach). During the meeting this report was also displayed via the WebEx interface.

Participants also had access to a document representing a compilation of editorial comments and suggestions for better wording from several WG members. During the meeting participants worked through this document, point-by-point, to ensure the WG addressed all the issues. The observer also had some minor tweaks, typos, and wording suggestions.

Most of the wordsmithing was done online during the meeting. A few formatting issues remained. The chair will clean up the document's appearance, and make sure changes have been incorporated accurately, before resending to the group for a final check.

**Note:**

After reviewing the document one last time, the WG submitted its final report to the Chair of the FRBR Review Group on September 12.