Meeting Report
San Juan, Puerto Rico, Monday, August 15, 2011

Business meeting attended by 8 members, 12 liaisons and observers (see Appendix A). Regrets: Rajesh Chandrakar, Felipe Martinez

1) Welcome and Announcements
   The WG on Aggregates has a second meeting scheduled:
   Tuesday Aug. 16, 15:00-17:00 (Room 102C)

   The FRBR Review Group has an all-day working meeting scheduled for August 19 at the Marriott San Juan Miramar.

   The minutes from the Aug. 12, 2010 business meeting were approved as distributed.

2) Review Group membership
   2.1) Election results
   At the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee meeting 3 members were elected or re-elected by acclamation for the term 2011 to 2015.
   Françoise Leresche (Bibliothèque nationale de France) was re-elected for a 2nd term.
   New members:
   Elena Escolano Rodríguez (National Library of Spain until Nov. 2011, since then Head of Standards at the Spanish Defense Ministry Libraries Coordination Unit)
   Filiberto Felipe Martínez-Arellano (Professor/Researcher at University Center for Library Science Research (CUIB) at National Autonomous University of Mexico)
   The chair thanked outgoing members Eeva Murtomaa and Barbara Tillett for their many and substantial contributions during their terms.

   2.2) Chair for 2011-2013
   The RG recommended that Pat Riva continue as chair for a final 2 year term. [Confirmed
3) Chair's report

3.1) FRSAD print publication
FRSAD was published in June 2011 by De Gruyter Saur as volume 43 of the *IFLA Series on Bibliographic Control*. The online pre-publication version is still up on the Classification & Indexing website (in PDF) and provides general access to the content. Maja will arrange for the RG to receive the Word version for consolidation work and also to provide to translation teams. Access will be provided via the FRBR RG working wiki.

3.2) FRAD
a) Lack of public online version
While we have permission to share the Word and PDF versions of FRAD with RG and working group members, including the CIDOC CRM SIG members, via the RG wiki, and for translation work, no public online version is available.
FRAD was published in 2009, two years ago, and not having a public version IS a problem. The RG will forward a request to the Cataloguing Section to raise this issue -- when can access be negotiated with De Gruyter Saur -- with the Professional Committee (and if appropriate with the new Committee on Standards).

Pat and Glenn received an odd request in fall 2010 from a university librarian in the US who wanted to reproduce the whole text of FRAD online as part of a training exercise for his department. Only the lack of an online text resulted in this request. This same group has reposted FRBR without asking for permission to reproduce FRBR. This request was not granted.

b) FRAD errata
The RG signed off on a number of errata that will be posted on the FRBR webpages. The most substantial of these is to add an attribute to the entity Family: Language of Family, in parallel to the attributes Language of Person and Language of Corporate Body. One larger item (role of titles of expressions) is deferred to the consolidation of the models, it will not be considered an errata.

3.3) Translations
FRBR: No new translations were finished this year. The Portuguese translation is published in print and the citation will be forwarded to the Information Coordinator for inclusion on the webpage. Vietnamese is still listed as in-progress, no status update has been received.
FRAD: 6 new translations were finished this year: Catalan (Biblioteca de Catalunya), French (BnF), Italian (ICCU), Russian, Swedish (BTJ) are available online; German (DNB) in print with De Gruyter Saur only. Along with the Chinese and Spanish translations completed in 2010, a total of 8 translations are finished. Croatian, Korean (Taesoo Kim, Yonsei University), Persian and Portuguese (BN Portugal) are in progress.
FRSAD: No translations have been completed yet. Chinese, Rumanian and Spanish are in progress. BnF is planning undertaking the French translation, Pat indicated that BAnQ

http://www.ifla.org/en/frbr-rg
would be willing to read it over.

3.4) Website
Only minor updates were done this year.

3.5) Finances / special project funds for 2010, 2011 and 2012
General expenses: meeting room rental and refreshments for breaks for the Aug. 19
meeting will come from the Cataloguing Section general admin funds.

Special projects:
2010: The remaining money (588 euros) was spent funding Pat and Maja's attendance at
the FRBR-CRM meeting in Nuremberg 20-22 December 2010. In total, we spent 1443
euros of the 1500 euros received, the unspent balance was 57 euros.

2011: Received 3000 euros for work related to model consolidation (both oo and er).
Some of the expenses for the May Heraklion meeting (Maja and Gord's expenses, 964
euros to 31 July) have been reimbursed, Pat's expenses are not yet submitted. The rest of
the funds will be fully expended to cover the November Amsterdam meeting. In fact,
3000 euros is not enough to ensure attendance when there are 2 meetings/year. The
Classification and Indexing Section has an unexpended balance in their admin funds, a
request will be made as to whether they would be willing to fund some of the expenses of
RG members who are also C&I Standing Committee members for that meeting.

2012: Another 3000 euros is included in the original request for the second part of the
Consolidation project. Expenses are difficult to predict as it is not clear how many CRM
meetings there will be in 2012. A mid-year RG meeting would certainly be useful, if
there is an event that would furnish an opportunity to bring members together.

3.6) Presentations and publications
Pat: Presented several times on the application of FRBR and FRAD within RDA.
Françoise: Many presentations in the context of RDA information.
Miriam: Also presented on FRBR and FRAD in relationship to RDA.
Gord: An extensive list of relevant presentations and papers in the Namespaces report.
Eeva: workshop in March 2011 in Paris\{check email\}

CCQ: A special issue on the FRBR family of conceptual models is in preparation.
Richard Smiraglia is the guest editor, Pat and Maja the editorial board. The call for
papers ended in May, a very exciting and international selection of submissions were
received.

3.7) DCMI invitation
The chair received an invitation from Corey Harper for an FRBR RG representative to
attend the meeting of the Vocabulary Management and Alignment group being held as a
pre-conference to DC2011 in The Hague, 21 September. Maja is attending DC2011 21-
23 September and will attend.

http://www.ifla.org/en/frbr-rg
4) Cataloguing Section Action Plan 2011-2013, FRBR section
The former Section strategic plans are to change format and become brief (2-3 item)
Action plans. The Cataloguing Section is identifying two action items relating to FRBR:

- Explore the preparation of a consolidated document for IFLA's FRBR family of
  conceptual models in an entity-relationship formulation

- Participate in the development of namespaces for all IFLA bibliographic standards,
  including the ISBD, FRBR, and FRAD and in connection with this promote and position
  the IFLA standards and models in the semantic web

More detail can be retained as Goals sections. The proposed ISBD section refers to a joint
project with the ISBD RG, as follows:
- Develop linkages between ISBD and the FRBR family of conceptual models in the RDF
  environment, to inform the further development of ISBD itself, and increase the
  understanding of the relations between ISBD and FRBR.

See also the Namespaces report recommendation #5 in section 7 below.

5) IFLA Core Activity on Bibliographic Standards and connection to FRBR RG
As reported at SCI, the proposed standards focus is going to take the form of a committee
rather than a core activity. Until the new Committee's mandate and operations are clearer,
its connection to the RG cannot be clarified. Once the chair (Patrice Landry) of the
Committee on Standards is confirmed, he will be added to the RG mailing list and wiki.

6) Reports from Working Groups
   6.1) WG on FRBR/CRM dialogue (P. Riva)
   Included in annual FRBR RG activity report submitted to the Cataloguing Section.
   Updates sent in to the webpages relating to FRBRoo on the FORTH site.

   6.2) WG on Aggregates (E. O'Neill)
   The Report, including an appendix, will be submitted following a final online meeting in
   September to complete the final editing. The Review Group received this report with
great interest and referred it to inform the consolidation process. Many thanks to the
chair, Ed O'Neill, and the members of the WG on Aggregates for their hard work.

7) Reports from IFLA task groups
   7.1) Namespaces Report on Recent Activity (G. Dunsire)
      (Report dated 14 July 2011 distributed separately)

Discussion:

http://www.ifla.org/en/frbr-rg
a) By not promoting the “published” status of the FRBRer namespace, we are encouraging developers to wait for a consolidated model for implementation. Some classes and properties may be deprecated by the consolidation.
b) The JSC has received a recommendation not to reuse the FRBRer namespace, rather to declare their own RDA-FRBR classes and properties. The development schedules of RDA and the FRBR family of models cannot be linked tightly enough for RDA to reuse our namespace. Also, RDA has a cardinality different in one of the basic relationships, a manifestation may link directly to a work, while in FRBR there must be an expression between the manifestation and the work.

Decisions on recommendations:
1. **Generic set of RDF properties for display labels.** Namespaces TF is the lead for this, FRBR RG to contribute as appropriate.
2. **Develop policies, guidelines and procedures for translation of FR namespaces.** Due to current constraints in the OMR, languages cannot be managed separately, thus encouraging translations cannot be a priority. Developing the needed policies, etc. can be deferred for the moment, but the need for this is noted.
3. **Tools etc. for maintaining human- and machine-readable representations in a single framework.** Namespaces TF is the lead for this, FRBR RG to monitor and contribute as appropriate.
4. **Namespace for unconstrained FR properties.** Not needed for either FRBR or linkage with RDA, monitor until a need is identified.
5. **Initiate a project with the ISBD RG to link FRBRer and ISBD namespaces.** Already in the Cataloguing Section strategic plan, see agenda item 4.
6. **Mechanisms for RDF links between related namespaces.** Namespaces TF is the lead for this, FRBR RG to contribute as appropriate.
7. **Negotiate for publication of freely downloadable versions of standards, e.g. FRAD.** Request support from the Cataloguing Section SC, and raise the issue with the new Committee on Standards.

8) Other business

**WLIC 2012 meetings:**
The opportunity for a 1-day working meeting in Helsinki is constrained by the satellite meetings both before and after WLIC, each of which involve some RG members. Potential for a half-day prior to the SC meetings, and another half-day off-site during the congress (for instance on the afternoon of the General Assembly). Eeva will be our contact to identify what rooms might be available.
## Appendix A

### List of participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aalberg, Trond</td>
<td>NTNU</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buizza, Pino</td>
<td>Biblioteca Queriniana</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cato, Anders</td>
<td>Gothenburg University Library</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>member of the WG on Aggregates, outgoing chair of the Cataloguing Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunsire, Gordon</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escolano Rodriguez, Elena</td>
<td>Spanish Defense Ministry Libraries (11/11)</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>incoming member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frodl, Christine</td>
<td>DNB</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galvao, Rosa</td>
<td>National Library of Portugal</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostage, John</td>
<td>Harvard Law School</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kavcic, Irena</td>
<td>National and University Library</td>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leresche, Françoise</td>
<td>Bibliothèque nationale de France</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murtomaa, Eeva</td>
<td>National Library of Finland</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>outgoing member, member of the WG on Aggregates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’Neill, Ed</td>
<td>OCLC</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>chair of the WG on Aggregates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patton, Glenn</td>
<td>OCLC</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Chair of FRANAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reser, David</td>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>observe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riva, Pat</td>
<td>Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Chair of FRBR RG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Säfström, Miriam</td>
<td>BTJ</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thurston, Patricia</td>
<td>Yale University</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>secretary of the WG on Aggregates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tillett, Barbara</td>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>outgoing member, member of the WG on Aggregates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weitz, Jay</td>
<td>OCLC</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Žumer, Maja</td>
<td>University of Ljubljana</td>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>member, member of the WG on Aggregates and WG on FRBR/CRM Harmonisation, co-chair of FRSAR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>