

INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION OF LIBRARY ASSOCIATIONS
AND INSTITUTIONS
WORLD LIBRARY AND INFORMATION CONGRESS



81th IFLA GENERAL CONFERENCE, Cape Town, South Africa
15-21 AUGUST 2015
CATALOGUING SECTION

ISBD/Linked Data Study Group
<http://www.ifla.org/en/node/1795>

Meeting: Tuesday, August 18th 2015 (Room 2.41/43, 2.44/46)

Draft Minutes¹

Attendees:

Members: María Violeta Bertolini (ISBD Linked Data SG chair), Vicent Boulet (incoming member), Gordon Dunsire, Massimo Gentili-Tedeschi (ISBD Review Group incoming chair), Dorothy McGarry, Clement Oury (ISSN Network Liaison), Ricardo Santos, Mirna Willer (ISBD Review Group outgoing chair).

Observers: Christine Oliver (University of Ottawa, FRBR Review Group chair), Rehab Ouf (Biblioteca Alexandrina, Classification and Indexing SC), Pat Riva (Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec, FRBR RG Consolidation Editorial Group member), Sandy Roe (Cataloguing & Classification Quarterly, Classification and Indexing SC), Agnese Galeffi (Vatican School of Library Science, Cataloguing Standing Committee Information Coordinator), John Hostage (Harvard University), Desine Abdel Meguid (Bibliotheca Alexandrina).

Apologies: Elena Escolano Rodríguez (member), Françoise Leresche (member), and Lynne Howarth (outgoing member).

1) Welcome and introductions

M. V. Bertolini welcomed the members and the observers.

M. V. Bertolini thanked the outgoing members for their contribution to the ISBD LD SG, and welcomed V. Boulet as a new ISBD LD SG member.

2) Announcements

Tuesday 18 August

14:00-16:00 ISBD RG (Room 2.41/43, 2.44/46)

Wednesday 19 August

¹ Note that these minutes do not necessarily reflect the chronological order in which each topic was discussed.

09:30-12:45 Impact of standards on the international library community. Committee on Standards– Open Session (Session 166, Auditorium 2)
13:15-14:45 SC II Cataloguing Section (Session 183, Room 1.63-1.64)

Thursday 20 August

10:45-12:45 Modeling Bibliographic Information for a Web of Data: Challenges and Achievements. Cataloguing Section – Open Session (Session 207, Auditorium 1)

3) Approval of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

4) Approval of the Minutes of the ISBD/Linked Data SG Meeting held in Lyon, August 2014²

The minutes were approved without changes.

4.1) Approval of the Minutes of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group’s Meeting Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, December 9th– 10th 2014

The minutes were approved without changes. The ISBD LD SG thanks Mélanie Roche, *Bibliothèque nationale de France*, for the detailed minutes of the Paris meeting.

5) Matters arising from the Minutes of the Lyon and Paris meetings and the Action list:

5.1) Alignment between ISBD and RDA namespaces

5.1.1) Alignment of the ISBD element set with the RDA element set

The Alignment of the ISBD: International Standard Bibliographic Description element set with RDA: Resource Description & Access element set, by G. Dunsire and the IFLA Cataloguing Section's ISBD Review Group, was published on 17 February 2015 (Version 3.1)³.

Action 1: G. Dunsire will check the ISBD/RDA alignment and inform us if an update is needed following the October 2015 update of RDA.

Action 2: G. Dunsire will update the alignment as needed.

5.1.2) Map of ISBD to RDA namespaces

The unconstrained ISBD elements were published by G. Dunsire in the Open Metadata Registry (OMR)⁴ in August 2015: this allows the ISBD/RDA namespaces mapping to be done using both unconstrained element sets.

Action 3: G. Dunsire will produce the ISBD/RDA namespaces mapping (in RDF) by April 2016.

5.1.3) Mapping of ISBD area 0 vocabularies to RDA/ONIX Framework vocabularies (G. Dunsire)

G. Dunsire reported that the JSC has recently published a namespace for the RDA/ONIX Framework element set and value vocabularies⁵. In the spirit of the protocol between the JSC and the ISBD

² http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ig-minutes_082014.pdf

³ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/OtherDocumentation/isbd2rda_alignment_v3_1.pdf

⁴ <http://iflstandards.info/ns/isbd/unc/elements/>

Review Group, the JSC has also published the alignments and RDF maps between the ISBD content form and media type vocabularies, and the Framework, agreed on by the ISBD Linked Data Study Group and the ISBD Review Group.

The alignments are presented in comma-separated variable (csv) format compatible with spreadsheets, and the maps are presented in RDF terse triple language (ttl). The files are available in the RDA Vocabularies project on GitHub, since IFLA doesn't have a GitHub account yet:

- <https://github.com/RDARegistry/RDA-Vocabularies/blob/master/csv/Aligns/alignISBD CF2ROF.csv>
- <https://github.com/RDARegistry/RDA-Vocabularies/blob/master/csv/Aligns/alignISBD CFX2ROF.csv>
- <https://github.com/RDARegistry/RDA-Vocabularies/blob/master/csv/Aligns/alignISBD MT2ROF.csv>
- <https://github.com/RDARegistry/RDA-Vocabularies/blob/master/ttl/Maps/mapISBD CF2ROF.ttl>
- <https://github.com/RDARegistry/RDA-Vocabularies/blob/master/ttl/Maps/mapISBD MT2ROF.ttl>

- <http://www.rdaregistry.info/Aligns/alignISBD CF2ROF.html>
- <http://www.rdaregistry.info/Aligns/alignISBD CFX2ROF.html>
- <http://www.rdaregistry.info/Aligns/alignISBD MT2ROF.html>
- <http://www.rdaregistry.info/Maps/mapISBD CF2ROF.html>
- <http://www.rdaregistry.info/Maps/mapISBD MT2ROF.html>

Each link is to a jump-off page with options to (raw) download the current file, (blame) view the change history of the file, and (history) access previous versions of the file.

The current files are linked to the following sections of the RDA Registry:

<http://www.rdaregistry.info/Aligns/index.html#isbd>

- Alignment of the ISBD: International Standard Bibliographic Description element set with the RDA: Resource Description and Access element set
- Alignment from ISBD content forms to the RDA/ONIX Framework
- Alignment from ISBD content form compounds to the RDA/ONIX Framework
- Alignment from ISBD media types to the RDA/ONIX Framework

<http://www.rdaregistry.info/Maps/index.html#rofisbd>

- Map from ISBD content forms to the RDA/ONIX Framework
- Map from ISBD media types to the RDA/ONIX Framework

G. Dunsire mentioned that there is a 404 error when trying to download .csv files, but at the time these minutes were published, the problem was already fixed.

The alignment from **ISBD content form compounds** does not have a corresponding map, because the compounds have not been assigned URIs; they are not individual concepts in the ISBD content form vocabulary. Aggregation of two terms cannot be mapped: that is the reason why they have to be published individually as compounds. This was discussed in the ISBD RG meeting and in the ISBD LD SG meeting, and it was decided to publish the ISBD content form compounds with specific URIs, and to use the ones needed in the mapping with ROF.

Action 4: G. Dunsire will circulate the vocabulary to be confirmed and approved by the SG.

⁵ <http://www.rdaregistry.info/rgAbout/rof.html>

Action 5: G. Dunsire will publish the ISBD content form compounds after approval.

G. Dunsire reported that the JSC has recently published guidelines on extending and refining the RDA/ONIX Framework base categories for RDA⁶.

Action 6: G. Dunsire will inform the ISBD LD SG of the impact of the process of RDA Extension.

5.2) Alignment between ISBD and FRBR namespaces

5.2.1) Alignment of the ISBD element set with the FRBR element set

The SG discussed that the ISBD/FRBR alignment is in process, and there was a question as to whether the draft version of FRBR Library Reference Model would have an impact on this mapping. It was decided that the mapping will be done to FRBR current namespaces, and another mapping will be produced when the final consolidated model is published.

5.2.2) Map of ISBD to FRBR namespaces

The ISBD LD SG worked on the ISBD/FRBR mapping during the IFLA WLIC in Lyon (August 2014), virtually via email after the meeting, and again at the Paris meeting (December 2014), where the group went through the existing alignment table and discussed every element that had raised comments. A detail of the issues that arose can be found in the *Minutes of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group's Meeting Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, December 9th-10th 2014*⁷. The comments were examined and discussed, and the final decision was documented. The group stopped right before the "Notes" area.

M. V. Bertolini agreed to work with M. Roche on editing this document before circulating it again to the group. However, some decisions remained to be made that were discussed during the IFLA WLIC in Cape Town in August 2015.

M. Roche and F. Leresche reported one of the main issues before the conference that the "C" alignment had to be discussed again. The decision of adding an alignment seemed like a good idea at the time of the Paris meeting in December 2014, but it actually complicates the mapping and creates inconsistency. It was recommended that "C" should be removed. The ISBD LD SG discussed this issue, and confirmed the decision to remove the "C" alignment.

Pat Riva explained that when there are questions regarding what FRBR means, the FRBR appendix expands the interpretation and needs to be taken as correct. If there are some errors in FRBR or if the term in the text doesn't match the definition, the group will need to make a comment in the mapping.

Action 7: ISBD LD SG will continue and finish the ISBD FRBR mapping before December 2015.

Action 8: M. V. Bertolini will edit the ISBD FRBR mapping file to: 1) erase comments for those lines that don't require further review (columns P to S) and record the final decision in Column P when precision is needed (green), 2) highlight with orange the lines that require direct action from the group as a whole, 3) left unfilled are the lines for which the final decision has not been

⁶ <http://www.rda-jsc.org/6JSC/ROFWG/3>

⁷ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-minutes_122014.pdf

documented in Column T. and that should therefore undergo another round of validation by the group.

Action 9: M. V. Bertolini will circulate the ISBD FRBR mapping to the ISBD LD SG for comments.

Action 10: M. V. Bertolini and M. Roche will compile the comments and circulate the final ISBD FRBR mapping for approval by the ISBD LD SG.

5.2.3) Further work and impact on the ISBD revision process and ISBD

The ISBD LD SG will continue to compile issues to be considered for the ISBD revision process, that have been raised during the ISBD/FRBR mapping, as well as other activities.

Action 11: The ISBD LD SG will submit documents/notes to be uploaded to the ISBD RG wiki in the process of preparing for the future ISBD revision.

5.3) Other alignments and mappings

- ISBD and the FRBR Library Reference Model: will be considered in the future, after final publication of the LRM.
- ISBD and UNIMARC/B: was done by Françoise Leresche and M. Willer to a certain extent, but it is not finalized. The team will continue to work on it, and expects to have results by August 2016. The document will be distributed also to the Linked Data Technical Sub-Committee (LIDATEC) for comments.
- MARC21 to ISBD: Ricardo Santos mentioned the possibility of doing a mapping from MARC21 to ISBD. The ISBD LD SG reminded Ricardo Santos that the group works on mappings from ISBD to other standards. However, if Ricardo Santos is willing to work on this mapping, the ISBD LD SG will be glad to review it and publish it on the website.

5.3.1) Diagram of mappings/alignments

The diagram of *Alignments between the namespaces of ISBD, other IFLA standards, and external standards*⁸ was published in the ISBD LD SG's site (version 1, July 2013). There are no changes to be included in this diagram yet, but it is expected that this diagram will be updated regularly, when needed.

Action 12: M. V. Bertolini will send the diagram of mappings/alignments to the Cataloguing Section as an input for the Standing Committee's strategic document.

5.3.2) Unconstrained namespaces for ISBD

G. Dunsire published the unconstrained ISBD elements in the Open Metadata Registry (OMR)⁹ in August 2015. As agreed in the ISBD Linked Data Study Group and the ISBD Review Group, the unconstrained version of an element has the same local URI part, label, and definition as the constrained version, but no domain (i.e. Resource) or range is declared. The URIs of

⁸ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/namespace-alignments_v1_20130725.pdf

⁹ <http://iflstandards.info/ns/isbd/unc/elements/>

the unconstrained elements are the same as indicated to SUDOC/ABES at the Paris meeting¹⁰ in April 2014.

Links from the constrained elements to the unconstrained versions have been added to the constrained ISBD element set, and they can be found in the Statements section of each element: <http://iflstandards.info/ns/isbd/elements/>.

The ISBD LD SG thanks G. Dunsire for publishing the element set and Metadata Management Associates (MMA) for testing the uploads, free of charge.

5.4) Guidelines for translations of RDF representations of ISBD

The Guidelines were compiled by the ISBD Linked Data Study Group, approved by the ISBD Review Group, the former IFLA Namespaces Technical Group, and the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, and were published as version 1.0 in May 2015¹¹.

Action 13: The ISBD RG Chair will submit the Guidelines to the IFLA Committee of Standards to request final approval.

5.5) Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data

The *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* were reviewed during the IFLA WLIC in Lyon (August 2014) and in the Paris meeting (December 2014). Several issues were discussed during the latter, a detailed account of which can be found in the *Minutes of the ISBD Linked Data Study Group's Meeting Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, December 9th-10th 2014*¹².

The text is almost ready: only the examples and a final review are pending. M. Gentili-Tedeschi, E. Escolano Rodriguez and Mélanie Roche agreed to undertake the task, working virtually via email.

The team is considering adding different examples with different levels of granularity conversion, and showing different ontologies. There was an idea of providing examples in all official languages but this was discarded due to complexity and the lack of vocabularies in some languages.

The SG decided that these *Guidelines* will serve as a state of the art document, so that libraries can use them as a guide. Examples taken from different sources will be corrected in syntax to show best practices.

Action 14: M. Gentili-Tedeschi will review the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* examples and circulate the document for comments within the ISBD LD SG.

Action 15: G. Dunsire offered to add some text regarding unconstrained namespaces, and about the discussion with ABES, to the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data*.

Action 16: M. Gentili-Tedeschi, E. Escolano Rodriguez and M. Roche will compile comments and produce the final document of the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* for approval.

¹⁰ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-minutes_042014.pdf

¹¹ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/OtherDocumentation/guidelines-ifla_isbd-namespace-translation-v.1.0_april2015.pdf

¹² http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-minutes_122014.pdf

Action 17: M. V. Bertolini will circulate the final *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* to the ISBD LD SG for approval.

Action 18: M. V. Bertolini will submit the approved *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* to the ISBD RG chair to start the IFLA standards process.

Action 19: M. Gentili-Tedeschi will send the approved *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee and the Committee on Standards for approval.

Action 20: M. Gentili-Tedeschi will send the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* as finally approved to A. Galeffi to be published on the website.

5.6) ISBD Application Profile

G. Dunsire submitted a draft Word document for the ISBD application profile and an updated version of the ISBD description set profile in XML. Publication of the unconstrained namespace allowed G. Dunsire to add the URIs to the description set and application profiles in place of the constrained versions, which are not really suitable for the components of an ISBD record below Area level (because their domain is Resource, not the part of the resource being described). The text version of the description set profile is embedded in the application profile document, so it doesn't need to be published separately.

Action 21: M. V. Bertolini will send the raw ISBD description set profile in XML (version 4) to A. Galeffi to be published on the ISBD LD SG website.

Action 22: M. Willer and G. Dunsire will add an introduction with reference to the history and discussions on the topic to the ISBD Application Profile.

Action 23: M. Gentili-Tedeschi and M. V. Bertolini will crosscheck the description set profile (Appendix B) with the application profile technical analysis (Appendix A).

Action 24: ISBD RG will send the ISBD Application Profile to LIDATEC, the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, BnF/ABES and DCMI for comments, and to the IFLA Committee on Standards for approval and publication.

5.7) Liaisons

5.7.1) Permanent UNIMARC Committee (M. Willer)

M. Willer reported that there are plans to publish UNIMARC/Bibliographic namespaces in OMR by the beginning of 2016 and the work on UNIMARC/Authorities will proceed in 2016.

5.7.2) DCMI (G. Dunsire)

G. Dunsire mentioned he was going to investigate whether the DC architecture group initiative has worked on sequencing issues in the context of its database of use cases for application profiles at fine-grained levels, but there is still no agreement regarding sequencing of elements and parsing. The situation is similar to last year.

5.7.3) RDA/ONIX Framework WG (G. Dunsire)

See point 5.1.3 above.

5.7.4) ISSN Network

The ISBD LD SG welcomes Clément Oury as the new ISSN Network liaison.

C. Oury reported that the ISSN Network comprises 88 national centres that carry on both cataloguing and registry duties; it is a very diverse network in terms of institution's size and technical facilities. The centres ingest ISSN records in the general registry either by direct cataloguing, transfer of MARC records, or use of Excel worksheets.

5.7.5) Other liaisons

There were no reports.

6) Chair's report

6.1) Project 2013: *ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Publication as Linked Data*

As the result of the project funded in 2013, *ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Publication as Linked Data* (G3.13.2-1/13), the ISBD Linked Data Study Group published¹³ the *Guidelines for translations of the IFLA ISBD namespace in RDF*, based on the *Guidelines for translations of IFLA namespaces in RDF (2013)*¹⁴. The *Guidelines* were compiled by the ISBD Linked Data Study Group, approved by the ISBD Review Group, the former IFLA Namespaces Technical Group, and the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, and were published as version 1.0 in May 2015¹⁵.

6.2) Project 2014: *Development of ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Usage*

The second meeting of the project *Development of ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Usage* (ID: 3-13-2-14) was carried out by the ISBD Linked Data Study Group, at the Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris, 9-10 December 2014 (Funding approved for 2014 for the two meetings under this project: 1800 €). The meeting continued the work on the *Guidelines for use of ISBD as linked data* and ISBD to FRBR namespaces alignment. Specific issues that were identified can be found in the meeting's draft minutes¹⁶. The ISBD LD Study Group will prepare both documents for comments and approval after the meetings in Cape Town.

7) Status of projects and issues arising

LIDATEC¹⁷ will have a meeting on Wednesday, August 19th. M. Willer and G. Dunsire, members of the ISBD LD SG and of LIDATEC will raise the issue of the need for an IFLA space in GitHub.

Action 25: G. Dunsire and M. Willer will share the minutes of the LIDATEC meeting to inform the ISBD LD SG on what was discussed.

8) Other business

¹³ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/OtherDocumentation/guidelines-ifla_isbd-namespace-translation-v.1.0_april2015.pdf

¹⁴ <http://www.ifla.org/node/5353>

¹⁵ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbd/OtherDocumentation/guidelines-ifla_isbd-namespace-translation-v.1.0_april2015.pdf

¹⁶ http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/cataloguing/isbdrg/isbd-ld-minutes_122014.pdf

¹⁷ <http://www.ifla.org/node/9428>

The ISBD LD SG Financial Report was part of the ISBD RG Report to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee. M. Willer reported on Project, 2014: Development of ISBD Namespaces Alignments and Usage (ID: 3-13-2-14) and its meeting reports: April 9th, 2014 and December 10th, 2014. The project received 1.800 Euros, with the balance of 11 Euros spent over the allotted funds. The funds covered travel and accommodation expenses for M. Gentili-Tedeschi and M. Willer for the two meetings.

**Respectfully submitted by Maria Violeta Bertolini
September 2015**