



International Federation of
Library Associations and Institutions

Cataloguing Section
FRBR Review Group

Meeting Report

Singapore, Sunday, August 18, 2013

Business meeting attended by 9 members, 2 liaisons, 6 observers (see Appendix A).
Regrets: Rajesh Chandrakar (outgoing member), Elena Escolano, Felipe Martinez; and
incoming members Tanja Mercun and Athena Salaba.

1) Welcome and Announcements

FRBR Review Group working meeting was planned for Monday **August 19, 2013**, 9:30-14:00 in room 309 of the convention centre.

The minutes from the Aug. 13, 2012 business meeting were approved as distributed.

2) Review Group membership

2.1) Election results

By the close of nominations on July 31, 2013, five strong nominations had been received to replace three outgoing members. At its meeting the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee approved the expansion of the FRBR RG to a total of 10 members and all 5 new members were elected by acclamation for the term 2013 to 2017.

New members:

- Patrick Le Boeuf (France)
- Anke Meyer-Hess (Germany)
- Tanja Mercun (Slovenia)
- Chris Oliver (Canada)
- Athena Salaba (USA)

The chair (herself an outgoing member) thanked two-term member Maja Žumer for her many substantial contributions during her terms.

2.2) Chair for 2013-2015

The RG recommended Chris Oliver (Canada) as the new chair for a 2 year term.

[Confirmed at the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee meeting.]

2.3) Corresponding members

Former member Eeva Murtomaa remains involved as a corresponding member, Marie Balikova (National Library of the Czech Republic) has expressed interest in being a corresponding member [approved at SC II].

2.4) Liaisons with ISSN Network, JSC, ISBD RG

The RG agreed to the following liaison appointments [ratified by the Cataloguing Section]:

François-Xavier Pelegrin, ISSN International Centre, had been agreed to by CATS by email in the spring;

Gordon Dunsire, incoming JSC chair, liaison with JSC (replacing Marg Stewart);

Françoise Leresche, liaison with ISBD RG.

In addition, the chairs of the 2 RGs extend reciprocal invitations attend meetings and exchange reports.

3) Chair's report

3.1) FRAD 2013 errata

These consist of 6 corrections, including some reported by the Japanese translation team. Although incorporated in the online text of FRAD, the separate errata file is intended to inform existing translations and document the changes made.

3.2) FRAD made available online

Our efforts to obtain permission for posting this document finally met with success. In March 2013, we were granted permission to post an updated text incorporating the errata published in 2011 and the additional errata just published. The file was posted August 1 and widely announced on distribution lists.

3.3) Translations of FRBR, FRAD and FRSAD

See the 2012-2013 Activities report for details on new translations. Some who have previously requested translation files have not been heard from in years.

Maria Violeta Bertolini points out problems with the published Spanish translation of FRBR. The RG recommends that she speak to RG member Elena Escolano and proposes posting a file of updates on the FRBR translations page.

3.4) SCATNews updates

A Review Group update appeared in SCATNews #39 (June 2013). I gave a more retrospective report as it is my last as chair.

3.5) Website

Only updated by posting links to translations, errata, etc. The chair did NOT get to the proposed 2012 action item of gathering recent publication citations from FRBR RG members.

3.6) Bill Denton's FRBR blog domain (www.frbr.org)

Communicated with Bill Denton in September 2012 following our Helsinki discussion. He agreed to keep the domain live for another year. IFLA policy does not allow us to conduct official business on an outside site; however, the existing information is valuable and should be kept, with a link to the official IFLA FRBR site. Miriam suggests that the Cataloguing Section will attempt to take over the registration, paying with administrative funds. This will at least prevent the domain name from being taken over for unrelated purposes. At this point the domains for FRAD and FRSAD do not seem to be in use.

3.7) Presentations and publications --- see Activities report

3.8) LODLAM 2013

This unconference on Linked Open Data in Libraries, Archives and Museums was held in Montreal, Canada, June 18-19, 2013. The chair hosted a discussion group on the FRBR family of models which encouraged valuable connections with others interested in the interrelations between FRBR (and CIDOC CRM) and archival models.

4) Financial

4.1) 2012 results

For the very first time we did not quite spend all the project funds. 2012 was the second year of a 2-year project. Our initial allotment was 3000 euros for the year, increased to 6000 euros to cover our mid-year meeting (April 2012 in London). We spent 5117 euros between the London meeting and the two CIDOC CRM meetings in 2012, however, Pat was unable to attend the November 2012 FRBRoo/CRM meeting in Amersfoort, Netherlands which would have spend the last of the funds.

4.2) Special project funds for 2013

We were successful in obtaining 3000 euros for 2013. The project proposal was called *Reassessment of properties in a consolidated conceptual model*, representing the next stages in the consolidation work. The application process is becoming more complex and the chair was asked to present a multi-year plan for the RG's work to put the project in context, which is now distributed. It now seems overambitious.

4.3) Ongoing funding

Still no news from the Standards Committee or the PC on future funding for standards. There are still no developments on the reporting structure for bibliographic standards.

5) WG on FRBR/CRM dialogue (P. Riva)

5.1) FRBRoo version 2.0

FRBRoo version 2.0 is very close to complete, there are a few issues to be considered during the October 2013 meeting to be followed by the remaining editorial work. The RG members supported the draft in principle. Approval stages should include opportunities

for comment from the Cataloguing and Classification&Indexing Section and the ISBD RG.

5.2) Namespace for FRBRoo v.2.0

In the preparation to create an IFLA namespace in the Open Metadata Registry for FRBRoo Gordon Dunsire identified two issues to resolve (circulated by email June 19)

- opaque URIs? In the FRBR(er)/FRAD/FRSAD namespaces the URI are opaque (do not use any words to identify the entities), but in the source file received from the CIDOC CRM SIG the identification includes the class and property names (ie. F1_Work, rather than just F1). The RG prefers to continue to use opaque URI in the OMR, for reasons of multilingual usage and consistency with the IFLA namespaces already created.
- Disambiguation of labels for properties: FRBRoo contains non unique labels. Although their identifiers differ, the same text can label multiple relationships that differ in their domains or ranges. The RG prefers to create unique labels by adding the names of the domain/range classes in parentheses, according to the practice already adopted for the FRBR family namespaces already created.

As the necessary information is already available in a file, just in another format, Gordon will arrange to have it batch loaded by MMT, saving a great deal of manual data entry. The FRBR RG will need to find funding for this one-time expense, expected to be in the range of 400 euros.

5.3) Next FRBR/CIDOC CRM meeting

This is scheduled for the week of 21-25 October 2013 (5 days) in Heraklion, Greece. Expect that the FRBR RG will be represented by Patrick Le Boeuf, Pat Riva, Maja Žumer. The agenda includes the remaining issues for FRBRoo version 2.0, some CRM issues and a session on archival issues.

6) Introduction to PRESSoo (Patrick Le Boeuf and François-Xavier Pelegrin)

PRESSoo is a compatible extension to FRBRoo to complete the detailed modeling of serials. It originates from work done in collaboration between the ISSN International Centre and the BnF. Patrick is to present the model at the Monday meeting. François-Xavier will appreciate reactions from the RG.

Discussion of the status of PRESSoo: as an extension to FRBRoo, to be approved it needs the assent of both the FRBR RG and the CIDOC CRM SIG. It will be on the agenda of the October CIDOC CRM meeting.

7) Consolidation of models (ER)

7.1) Organization of the work

Although to date the consolidation of models has been a project of the whole RG, the creation of an editorial group is proposed because it is hard to do editorial work with a group of 10 people, and some outgoing members are willing to remain involved as TG members or as consultants.

The RG recommended the creation of a Consolidation Editorial Group with four members: Patrick Le Bœuf, Pat Riva, Miriam Säfström, Maja Žumer.
[This was approved by the Cataloguing Section SC]

7.2) Fall 2013 meeting for consolidation project

The BnF offered to host the meeting in Paris. The ISBD RG also plans to meet, holding the meetings consecutively (2 days FRBR, 2 or 3 days ISBD) will permit the joint attendance of several members. There was discussion of various dates as close as possible to the FRBR/CIDOC CRM Harmonisation Group meeting October 21-25, 2013 in Heraklion, Crete, Greece. [The final decision was confirmed later in the week: FRBR 14-15 October, ISBD 16-18 October.]

8) IFLA Namespaces Technical Group (Gordon Dunsire)

More extensive updates were published in SCATNews. Topics being discussed during this conference that are particularly of interest to the RG:

- Translations of namespaces: Guidelines completed. Only a few translations of FR namespaces have been done. Upgrades to the OMR permitting language-specific accounts will facilitate the management of this work. To ensure that the terminology used in the translation of a namespace matches the published translation of the standard on which it is based, the RG will recommend to the Committee on Standards that the standard agreement for translation should also include responsibility for the namespace.
- Use of unconstrained namespaces.
- Guidelines on use of and extending the IFLA namespaces.

9) ISBD Review Group (Mirna Willer)

The ISBD RG circulated to the FRBR RG the paper *Resource and Work, Expression, Manifestation, Item which considers the relationship* between these entities. Any alignment of properties between the ISBD and FRBR namespaces requires a resolution of this issue which will be discussed at the ISBD/XML Study Group meeting.

10) Updates from other projects and groups

Not done for lack of time.

11) Meetings at IFLA WLIC 2014 in Lyon, France

Due to the pre-WLIC satellite conferences, a full-day working meeting on Friday, August 22 (day for library visits) is the most likely.

Appendix A**List of participants**

Name	Institution	Country	Status
Aagaard, Harriet	National Library of Sweden	Sweden	observer
Abdelhalim, Manal	Library of Alexandria	Egypt	observer (Aug. 19 only)
Balikova, Marie	National Library of the Czech Republic	Czech Republic	corresponding member
Bertolini, Maria Violeta	IFTS no. 13	Argentina	observer
Dunsire, Gordon	Independent	UK	member, JSC liaison
Frodl, Christine	Deutsche Nationalbibliothek	Germany	observer
Galeffi, Agnese	Vatican School of Library Science	Italy	observer (Aug. 19 only)
Gentili-Tedeschi, Massimo	Biblioteca nazionale Braidense, Milano	Italy	observer
Le Boeuf, Patrick	Bibliothèque nationale de France	France	member
Leresche, Françoise	Bibliothèque nationale de France	France	member, liaison with ISBD RG
Meyer-Hess, Anke	Deutsche Nationalbibliothek	Germany	member
Oliver, Chris	McGill University	Canada	member, incoming chair of FRBR RG
Ouf, Rehab	Library of Alexandria	Egypt	observer (Aug. 19 only)
Pelegrin, François-Xavier	ISSN International Centre	France	liaison with ISSN
Riva, Pat	Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec	Canada	outgoing member, outgoing chair of FRBR RG
Roe, Sandy	Cataloging & Classification Quarterly	USA	observer
Säfström, Miriam	National Library of Sweden	Sweden	member
Weitz, Jay	OCLC	USA	observer
Willer, Mirna	University of Zadar	Croatia	chair of ISBD RG
Žumer, Maja	University of Ljubljana	Slovenia	outgoing member

